Overview of community noise annoyance research: New trends in Community Reaction in Europe and in the USA

Uwe Müller (DLR)
Outlook

• Survey of research projects on aircraft noise effects in the last 5 years in the EU member states (+ Norway/Switzerland)

• FAA Civil Aviation Noise Policy and Roadmap in the United States

• WHO initiative to update Environmental Noise Guidelines for the European Region

• Appendix: More detailed descriptions of the studies on aircraft noise effects in the last 5 years in the EU member states
Survey of research projects on aircraft noise effects in the last 5 years in the EU member states (+ Norway/Switzerland)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEBATS</td>
<td>3.3 M€</td>
<td>France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>harmonica</td>
<td>1.7 M€</td>
<td>France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARASOFT</td>
<td>320 k€</td>
<td>France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MultiExpo</td>
<td>150 k€</td>
<td>France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORAH</td>
<td>7.3 M€</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Flight study</td>
<td>? k€</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bremer Fluglärmstudie</td>
<td>? k€</td>
<td>Germany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMEGA</td>
<td>59 k€</td>
<td>UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noise Metrics</td>
<td>61 k€</td>
<td>UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heathrow Trials</td>
<td>111 k€</td>
<td>UK</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Sleep</th>
<th>Sound Quality</th>
<th>Helicopter</th>
<th>Annoyance</th>
<th>Metrics</th>
<th>Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project</td>
<td>Funding</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health research South Limburg</td>
<td>500 k€</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rattle (perception)</td>
<td>300 k€</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MaxFlyg</td>
<td>330 k€</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VARIANCE</td>
<td>300 k€</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swiss Nat. Cohort</td>
<td>100 k€</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SiRENE</td>
<td>1,7 M€</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sound Quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helicopter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annoyance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2009 - 2015

- Health: 6.8 M€ + ? k€ (1.8 M€ Switzerland)
- Annoyance: 3.1 M€ + (3 k€ Norway)
- Metrics: 1.8 M€
- Sleep: 1.0 M€
- Children: 800 k€
- Helicopter: 300 k€

Total: 13.8 M€ + ? k€ (+ 2.1 M€ Norway and Switzerland)
More detailed information on the studies: see Appendix of this presentation
The following countries were involved in the EU-FP7 Project COSMA (Community Oriented Solutions to Minimise aircraft noise Annoyance)

2009-2013

Budget WP2 « Annoyance Examinations »: 2.2 M€
The following countries were involved in the EU-FP6 Project MIME (Market-based Impact Mitigation for the Environment)

2007-2010

Budget: 2.6 M€
FAA Civil Aviation Noise Policy and Roadmap in the United States
Review of Civil Aviation Noise Policy in the United States

Presented to: ICBEN
By: Rebecca Cointin, FAA
Date: June 4, 2014
**Goals:** Resolve key questions related to impacts of civil aircraft noise & provide sound data to inform policy

**Research Framework:** Knowledge, Tools, Mitigation, Analysis & Implementation

- Characterize source of noise and emissions
- Evaluate propagation of noise as well as dispersion and transformation of pollutants
- Understand health and welfare impacts of noise and pollutants

*Integrated Analysis* → *Improved Scientific Knowledge* → *Aviation Environmental Tool Suite* → *Transition & Implementation*

*EMS* → *Develop Mitigation* → *Transition & Implementation*
## FAA Noise Research Roadmap

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annoyance</td>
<td>Previous work</td>
<td>Survey and Updated Dose-Response Curve</td>
<td>DNL Appropriateness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s Learning</td>
<td>Previous work</td>
<td>Effects of Aircraft Noise</td>
<td>Potential COE work</td>
<td>Case Studies and data analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td>Signal Identification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Potential field and case studies in partnership with others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep Disturbance</td>
<td>Previous work</td>
<td>Field studies and data analysis</td>
<td>Awakening Methodology Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helicopter</td>
<td>Performance Methodology</td>
<td>Performance Methodology</td>
<td>Psychoacoustics/Vibroacoustics metrics</td>
<td>Correlate with respect to fixed wing aircraft</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Propagation</td>
<td>Ray Tracing validation and implementation</td>
<td>PE/FP development, validation and implementation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supersonic</td>
<td>Participation in CAEP WG1 Task Group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tools
- AEDT Modeling Improvement, including helicopter modeling and supplemental metrics
- Research of monetization of metrics for inclusion into APMT-1

### Policy/Guidance
- Helo Stage 3 Rulemaking
- UAS Certification Study
- DNL Policy
- Possible guidance for non-DNL metrics (supplemental metrics)

### International
- ICAO SSTG: Formulate “Preliminary” standards
- ICAO SSTG: Validate “Preliminary” Standards
- SSTG: Promulgate Standards

Is there a metric besides DNL we should continue to pursue?
FAA Noise Research Roadmap

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annoyance</td>
<td>Previous</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>work</td>
<td></td>
<td>Survey and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Updated Dose-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Response Curve</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DNL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Appropriateness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s</td>
<td>Previous</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>work</td>
<td></td>
<td>Case Studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>in schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and data analysis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Annoyance**
  - DNL 65 dB appropriateness through social surveys
  - DNL Appropriateness

- **Children’s Learning**
  - Benefits of sound insulation of schools to test scores
  - Case study of reactions in classrooms of aviation noise
  - Exploration of the appropriate metric to measure the noise associated with children’s learning
### FAA Noise Research Roadmap

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep Disturbance</td>
<td>Previous work</td>
<td>Validation Field studies and data analysis</td>
<td>Awakening Methodology Development</td>
<td>Case studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Health**
  - Further exploration of link between aviation noise and cardiovascular disease in the elderly

- **Sleep Disturbance**
  - Development of methods for conducting field studies to study the impact of aviation noise on sleep
  - Pilot field study to test such methods
Thank you

Rebecca Cointin
rebecca.cointin@faa.gov

Additional Authors:
Lourdes Maurice, PhD
Lynne Pickard
Katherine Andrus
James Hileman, PhD
**ACRP - Annoyance studies** and updating the exposure-response curve for annoyance („Schultz curve“) - there will be surveys at 20 civil U.S. airports served predominantly by jet aircraft, 2014–2016.

**Sleep studies** - FAA currently funding a pilot study at Philadelphia airport (University of Pennsylvania in cooperation with DLR), 2013-2015. Further studies intended.
WHO initiative to update Environmental Noise Guidelines for the European Region
**Objective:** Updating the current WHO guidelines for noise effects on annoyance, sleep, cognitive impairment, cardiovascular diseases, hearing impairment, tinnitus, adverse birth outcomes, and mental health and wellbeing.

**Method:** systematic review and meta-analysis of existing publications

**Duration:** 2013-2015

**Budget:** ~? k€

**Partners:** Scientists worldwide, who are required to declare all potential personal, financial, and academic interests by completing the WHO Declaration of Interests form.
Implications for EU roadmap and aircraft noise policy?
Suggestions tomorrow!

**Day 2**  
*Location: Room CCAB-4D, Centre Albert Borschette, 36 rue Froissart, 1040 Etterbeek (Brussels)*

**8h30**  
Registration and Welcome Coffee

**9h00**  
*Session 4: Noise research priorities and roadmap*  
*Chair: Hervé Consigny (ONERA, EREA)*

- Overview of aviation noise research roadmap  
  *X-NOISE Coordinator / D. Collin, 20'*
- EREA proposal for advanced and coordinated research on noise: 1h30'
  - General introduction  
    *ONERA / L. Leylekian*
  - Research action on methods, low-TRL enablers and thorough understanding of noise generation and propagation  
    *NLR / Harry Brouwer*
  - Research action on noise impact, perception and community annoyance  
    *DLR / Uwe Müller*
  - Integrating and assessing noise research efforts at European and national levels  
    *X-NOISE & ONERA / D. Collin & L. Leylekian*
Thank you to everyone contributing to the compilation of all this information!

Thank you very much for your attention!
Appendix
Acronym: **DEBATS** (Discussion sur les Effets du Bruit des Aéronefs Touchant la Santé)

**Objective:**

Impact of Aircraft noise on health.

**Duration:** 2011-2018

**Budget:** 3.3 Mil. €, la Direction Générale de la Santé, la Direction Générale de la Prévention des Risques (Ministère de l’Écologie, du Développement Durable et de l’Énergie), la Direction Générale de l’Aviation Civile, l'Ifsttar et l'Agence nationale de sécurité sanitaire de l’alimentation, de l’environnement et du travail (Anses).

**Partners:** Ifsttar, Bruitparif, CépDc Inserm
France

**Acronym:** *harmonica* (HARMOnised Noise Informations for Citizens and Authorities)

**Objective:**
Increase the assimilation of the noise issue by the general public and local public authorities and to improve information on noise pollution in Europe. To build innovative tools to publish information on environmental noise in an easy-to-understand way and to develop a common noise index, CNI

**Duration:** 2011-2014

**Budget:** 1.7 Mil. €, European Commission (50%)

**Partners:** Acoucité, Bruitparif, Working Group Noise, Eurocities
Acronym:  **PARASOFT** (PsychoAcoustics Research aiming at Assessing Sonic unpleasantness of aircraft flyovers)

**Objective:**

the PARASOFT project aims at keeping on the previous European projects SEFA and COSMA:
- Proposing a quantification of spectral effects on sound quality
- Proposing a quantification of temporal features on sound quality
- Proposing a quantification of cross combination effects
- Comparing the effects of these factors to the one of a reduction of overall loudness.

**Duration:** 2013-2015

**Budget:** 320 k €, FRAE (Fondation de recherche pour l'aéronautique et l'espace)

**Partners:** ONERA, UCP, Genesis
Objective:
Health effects of transportation noise (in particular aircraft) at Frankfurt Airport
- hypertension, cardio-vascular diseases
- changing noise exposure => annoyance & HQoL
- changing nocturnal aircraft noise exposure => sleep;
- cognitive performance and HQoL in children

Comparison of responses to transportation noise (annoyance, sleep disturbances, disturbances at daytime)
Effects of aircraft, road and railway noise (and combination)
Expanding (Frankfurt, Berlin) and steady state airports (Cologne/Bonn, Stuttgart)

Duration: 2011-2015

Budget: 7.3 Mil €, German Federal State of Hessia (86.4 %), airport municipalities (2.3 %), Frankfurt airport (10.1 %), airlines (1.2 %)

Partners: Ruhr-University Bochum, German Aerospace Centre DLR, Hörzentrum Oldenburg, Möhler + Partner, SUZ, Technical University of Kaiserslautern, University of Dresden, University of Giessen, ZEUS
Acronym: Bremer Fluglärmstudie

Objective: Health impact of aircraft noise at Bremen airport
(epidemiological study using health insurance data and mortality indices)

Duration: 2011-2015

Budget: ~? k€ (no information available), German Federal Environment Agency UBA

Partners: EpiConsult GmbH
Acronym: *The FLIGHT-Study*

**Objective:** Effect of nighttime aircraft noise exposure on endothelial function and stress hormone release in healthy adults

**Duration:** 2009-2013

**Budget:** ~? k€ (no information available), University of Mainz

**Partners:** University of Mainz
Project: Health research South Limburg

Objective: Research on Health effects of aircraft noise for the NATO Airbase Geilenkirchen and Beek Airport

Duration: 2012-2014

Budget: ~500 k€, Dutch Ministry of Infrastructure and Environment

Partners: National Institute for Public Health and the Environment RIVM - partners: NLR and Municipal Health service GGD
**Project:** Rattle

**Objective:** Research on Helicopter Rattle (vibrations) perception

**Duration:** 2013-2014

**Budget:** ~300 k€, Dutch Ministry of Defence

**Partners:** NLR, TNO
Objective: To assess possible differences in the response to noise around civil and military airports

Duration: 2014-2015

Budget: 300,000 €

Partners: The Norwegian Defence Estates Agency and SINTEF
Acronym: MaxFlyg

Objective:

How does the number of aircraft passages above 70 dBA correlate to annoyance? Questionnaires (4786 sent 3130 answers) to residents near seven Swedish airports & listening tests (physiological, annoyance & speech interference)

Duration: 2009-2012

Budget: ~330.000 €

Partners: University of Stockholm
Great Britain

**Acronym:** OMEGA Community Noise Study; *Indices to enhance understanding and management of community responses to aircraft noise exposure*

**Objective:**

To test public understanding of a range of conventional and supplementary noise communication metrics, through focus groups

**Duration:** 2008-2009

**Budget:** £ 46 k Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE)

**Partners:** study: Manchester Metropolitan University, Southampton University, British Airports Authority & Manchester Airport

**OMEGA:** 9 UK Universities: lead by Manchester Metropolitan University, Cambridge and Cranfield Universities; a £5 Mil consortium for 3 years (2007-2010)
Objective: to investigate additional or supplementary aircraft noise metrics that could be used to complement or reinforce existing standard metrics when describing or communicating aircraft noise exposure to the general public and other airport stakeholders.

- extension to the original OMEGA work

Duration: 2010-2011

Budget: £ 48k, Heathrow Airport Limited

Partners: Manchester Metropolitan University, Southampton University
Acronym: Engaging with Residents: Heathrow Operation Freedom Trials

Objective:

- to investigate the impact of the suspension of runway alternation at Heathrow during a period of ‘operational freedom’ trials designed to address delays and stacking arising from the capacity constraints imposed by alternation
- understand the impact of the Operation Freedom Trials on residents;
- establish residents’ preferred airport response to excessive delays – current limited response versus a short period of dual-mode operations
- identify whether there are other aspects of airport management that residents would prefer to be changed

Duration: 2011-2012

Budget: £ 87k; Heathrow Airport Ltd

Partners: MVA (now Systra), Southampton University, Manchester Metropolitan University
Acronym: **SiRENE - Short and long term effects of transportation noise exposure**

**Objective:**

SiRENE aims at identifying the noise exposure patterns that most strongly elicit effects on the organism and that may result in long term health consequences (e.g. cardiovascular diseases and metabolic syndrome).

**Duration:** 2014-2016

**Budget:** 1.65 Mio €, Swiss National Science Foundation

**Partners:** University of Basel, Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute, Swiss Federal Laboratories for Materials Science and Technology, Swiss Federal Office for the Environment, n-sphere
Acronym: No acronym, but study was part of the Swiss National Cohort
„Aircraft noise, Air pollution, and Mortality from Myocardial Infarction“

Objective:
Huss et al present the first large-scale epidemiologic study investigating a link between residential exposure to aircraft noise and mortality from myocardial infarction (MI) in Switzerland.

Duration: published in 2010, data from 2001-2005

Budget: probably a minor budget < 100,000 €, Swiss National Science Foundation

Partners: University of Bern, University of Basel, Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute, University of Utrecht
**Objective:**
The study identified and developed a methodology that allows a unified approach to assess the effects of noise from road, rail and airport on the population. 
The objective was to determine dose-effect relations that can be used to establish the degree of population discomfort and annoyance created by transport noise. 
A methodology is proposed to develop regulations and guidelines and to establish strategic approach to assess, manage and monitoring the ambient noise including the evaluation of a human response to the estimated discomfort and annoyance.

**Duration:** December 2012

**Budget:** around 9000 EUR / Financed by the Ministry of Environment and Forests

**Partners:** CEPSTRA GROUP, PhD.Eng. Mihai ZAPLAIC

**Acronym:** ME - Study for the development of guidelines to determine dose-effect relations for assessing the annoyance on population, due to the noise from traffic